

Implementation of Total Quality Management: The Effect on Patient Safety Culture, Service Quality, and its Impact on Patient Satisfaction and Private Hospital Performance in Manado City

Jessy Jousina Pondaag

Sam Ratulangi University, Faculty of Economics and Business
Management Department, Management Science Doctoral Program
95115 Manado, North Sulawesi, Indonesia

Paulus Kindangen

Sam Ratulangi University, Faculty of Economics and Business
Management Department, Management Science Doctoral Program
95115 Manado, North Sulawesi, Indonesia

Hendra Novi Tawas

Sam Ratulangi University, Faculty of Economics and Business
Management Department, Management Science Doctoral Program
95115 Manado, North Sulawesi, Indonesia

Jacky Sigfried Beatrix Sumarauw

Sam Ratulangi University, Faculty of Economics and Business
Management Department, Management Science Doctoral Program
95115 Manado, North Sulawesi, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this research is to determine the effect of implementation of Total Quality Management (TQM) on patient safety culture, service quality, patient satisfaction, and hospital performance. This research conducted in private hospitals in Manado City which are: GMIM Pancaran Kasih Hospital, Advent Hospital, Sitti Maryam Hospital, and Siloam Hospital. The research approach used in this research is quantitative approach. The population in this research is the inpatients. Data collection technique conducted by questionnaires, documentation and observation. The sampling technique used in this research is saturated sampling (census). Data analysis conducted by using path analysis with the using SPSS ver. 25. The result of this research shows that the implementation of Total Quality Management impacted positively significantly on patient safety culture, the implementation of Total Quality Management impacted positively significantly on hospital service quality, the implementation of Total Quality Management impacted insignificantly on patient satisfaction, the implementation of Total Quality Management impacted positively significantly on hospital performance, Patient Safety Culture impacted positively significantly on patient satisfaction, Patient Safety Culture impacted positively significantly on hospital performance, Service Quality impacted positively significantly on hospital performance, Hospital

Performance impacted positively significantly on hospital performance, and Patient Satisfaction impacted positively significantly on hospital performance.

Keywords: total quality management, patient safety culture, service quality, patient satisfaction, hospital performance, organizational performance.

INTRODUCTION

The Background of Research Problem

In this industrial revolution 4.0, every sector entering an era of change and massive competition. Industrial revolution 4.0 pushes technological innovations and service that provide disruption effect or fundamental change to social life. This condition creates challenge for industrial world even for hospital. Resulted from this industrial revolution 4.0, there is a fierce competition in hospital industry, that then push hospital management to make changes and innovations in every field in responding to the demands and needs of consumer and/or patients. This condition encourages the owner or hospital management especially private hospital to manage their hospital well, noticing the service efficiency and effectiveness that focusing on service quality that safe for every patient. If this isn't happened, hospital will be disrupted with any changes. This is the reason why hospital needs to reduce any error or fail level in provide their service to the patient so that the hospital can be reference hospital in health service or personal recovery.

Hospital is a service provider that has an important role in social life especially in health sector. As a place that has complexity such as pharmaceuticals, hundred of tests, and procedures, a lot of equipment and technology, also a lot of jobs in services for 24 hours everyday, make hospital should be manage well so it won't cause any adverse events that threatening the safety of patients (DepKes, 2008).

Furthermore, as stated in *Undang-Undang 23 Tahun 1992* about health, it is explained that health service is a citizen right available that given with quality, affordable for every citizen. So, it is important for the government in this case the Health Department as the official holder in handling health problem in Indonesia, as well as hospital management, to be cautious with the needs and wants, and also the expectation from the citizen who wants a good service.

In Indonesia, the growth of hospital based on the data until April 2018 shows in the Picture 1.1 as follows:



Picture 1.1 Hospital Growth in Indonesia until April 2018

Source: <http://sirs.yankes.kemkes.go.id/rsonline/report/>

LITERATURE REVIEW

Literature Review

This section explaining about the concept and theories underlying this research, which are: Organizational Performance as the grand theory, Hospital Performance as the applied theory, Quality Theory as the middle theory, Total Quality Management, Service Quality, Patient Safety Culture, and Consumer (Patient) Satisfaction, as the applied theory as well as the related previous research as the references.

Organizational Performance

Based on Gavrea et al. (2012) there is no universally accepted definition of organizational performance. There are several ideas describing the concept of organizational performance, such as: 1) Performance is a financial and non-financial device that provide information on whether the purpose and the result met. 2) Performance is a dynamic, it is needed to have a judgment and interpretation, 3) Performance is illustrated by using a quality model that explain how an action affecting the future result, 4) Performance understood in several different way depending on the person involved in organizational performance appraisal, 5) Concept of work needs the knowledge on the characteristics of every elements in every accountability, 6) For the report of organizational performance level, it is needed to have the ability to quantify the result.

Definition of Hospital

Hospital is a form of organization providing individual health service in general. Inside its organization there is a lot of activities, that conducted by the officer from a lot of type of profession, whether medical profession, paramedic or non-medic. Based on *Permenkes No. 147 Tahun 2010* on hospital licensing that: Hospital is an institution of health services provider that conducting individual health service plenary that provide inpatient service, outpatient service, and emergencies.

Quality Theory

Quality is defined varies from the conventional way up to the more strategic point of view. The conventional definition of quality usually depicting a direct characteristic of certain product such as: performance, reliability, ease of use, esthetic, and so on. The strategic definition of quality based on Gasperz (2005) is anything that is able in meeting the wants and needs of customers.

Total Quality Management

There is a lot of definition of TQM, but each one of the experts have their own ideas in formulating the definition of TQM. According to Tjiptono and Anastasia (2003), "TQM is an approach in performing effort in order to maximize the organizational competitiveness by continuous improvement on product, service, people, processes, and its environment". According to Gasperz (2011), "TQM define as a way of continuous performance improvement on every level of operation or process, in every functional area of organization, by using every human resource and capital available". On the other hand, Purnama (2006) stated, "TQM is a structural system with a set of equipment, technique, and philosophy designed to create organizational behavior focusing on consumer, involve the employee actively, and

continuous quality improvement in order to appropriately suit consumer needs (Nursya'bani Purnama, 2006).

Quality Management, Global Perspective, First Edition, *Ekonsia Fakultas Ekonomi*, stated "TQM is a managerial innovation that emphasizing on the total organizational commitment to the consumer and continuously improve their quality on every process using problem-solving approach, stirred by data, based on group empowerment and employee's teams.

Service Quality

According to Tjiptono and Chandra (2011), the concept of quality determined as the level of perfection of product or service that consist of design quality and conformance quality. Design quality is a specific function of a product or service, conformance quality is a measurement on how much the level of conformity between a product or service with the requirement or specification quality set. That's why quality is a condition in which several factors met the consumer needs as stated by Goetsh and Davis in Tjiptono and Chandra (2011) considering the quality, which is, "The dynamic condition related to product, service, human resource, process, and environment that met or exceed the expectation".

Patient Satisfaction

The word satisfaction comes from Latin "satis" which means good or suffice and "facio" which means do or create. Satisfaction can be defined as "An effort to fulfill something" or "make something sufficient". According to Kotler cited by Tjiptono and Chandra (2011), consumer satisfaction is a level of personal perception after comparing the performance or result to the perceived expectation.

RESEARCH METHOD

This chapter explaining the steps that will be conducted in analyzing the model developed in the previous chapter. These steps that will be explained are as follows: research design, research location, population and sample, type and source of data, data collection method, data analyzing technique, and variable and its measurements.

Research Design

This research uses quantitative approach with associative research as the level of explanation, which is a research that explaining the influence between variables in research model.

Research Location

The location of this research is every general hospital with private ownership (non government-owned) in Manado City which are: Pancaran Kasih Hospital, Advent Manado Hospital, Sitti Maryam Hospital, Siloam Hospital Manado.

Population and Sample

Population

Population is generalization area consist of object and subject that are becoming the quantity and certain characteristics set by the researcher to be studied and then concluded (Sugiyono, 2016). The population in this research is inpatient in every private-owned hospital in Pancaran

Kasih Hospital, Advent Hospital, Sitti Maryam Hospital, and Siloam Hospital, that already treated for more than three days.

The consideration in determining the population is that, the researcher assume that the minimal of three days is sufficient for patient to assess the service performance and other related thing appropriate to the research variable in the hospital where the patient being treated.

Sample

The total of population is becoming the sample in this research, however the suitable sample that can be analyzed using questionnaires only counted to 112 respondents. Meanwhile, the other questionnaires can not be analyzed because the patient not willing to or not in a good condition for this research.

Data Collection Technique

Data collection techniques used in this research are consist of: documentation and questionnaires.

a. Questionnaires

Questionnaires used to measure the variables used in this research. Questionnaires is the main research instrument in this research. The questions design in questionnaires is closed-ended questions in which the option of answer is already determine by the research.

b. Documentation

Documentation used in order to collect various secondary data needed in analyzing research data.

c. Observation

Observation in this research is conducted by research using direct observation to find facts on the field related to the implementation of Total Quality Management.

Scale of Research Instrument

Scale in research instrument is used in close-ended question in questionnaires. In this research, the scale of instrument used in this research is Likert Scale. In Likert Scale, the variable measured is becoming the variable indicator. Then the indicator becoming the point to arrange the items for question instrument or statement. The answer of questionnaires grading from strongly positive to strongly negative, with the choice of answer and score as follows:

- | | |
|----------------------|-----|
| a. Strongly Agree | (5) |
| b. Agree | (4) |
| c. Neutral | (3) |
| d. Disagree | (2) |
| e. Strongly Disagree | (1) |

Research Instrument Test Method

In order to produce accurate and reliable data, the research instrument (questionnaires) must fulfill the validity and reliability requirements through test. Research instrument test uses

validity test and reliability test. Validity test conducted by determining the accuration of research instrument on the measured concept to make sure it measures what is should be measured (Riduwan and Kuncoro, 2017). Reliability test conducted to determine the level of reliability or accuracy of the research instrument used (Riduwan and Kuncoro, 2017).

Validity Test

The technique used to conduct validity test is convergent test. Convergent validity is related the principle in which the measurement of certain construct should have a high correlation. The validity test used in this research is factor analysis. Pearson Product Moment Correlation used in this validity test. The test conducted by using IBM-SPSS program.

Reliability Test

A questionnaire is determined reliable if the answers from respondents are same or repeatedly given, consistent or stable from time to time. In this research, the reliability test conducted on the items that already pass the validity test and considered valid. A construct of variable considered reliable if product the value of Cronbach's Alpha > 0.60. the reliability test in this research conducted by using the IBM-SPSS program.

Data Analysis Technique

Data analysis technique used in this research is path analysis with the help of SPSS version 25. Researcher uses path analysis in order to determine the cause-effect relationship, explaining the direct and indirect influence between exogeneous variable and endogeneous variable. According to Riduwan and Kuncoro (2014), path analysis model used to analyze the relationship pattern between variable with the purpose to determine the direct and indirect influence of a set of exogeneous variable on endogeneous variable.

As for the benefit of path analysis which are (Riduwan and Kuncoro, 2017):

- a. To explain a phenomenon studied or problem researched.
- b. Predicting the value of endogeneous variable (Y) based on the value of exogeneous variable (X).
- c. Determinant factor which is the determining of independent variable that influence dominantly on the dependent variable, also can be used to browse the influence mechanism or paths of the independent variable on the dependent variable.

Basic Assumptions of Path Analysis

The effectivity of the using path analysis according to Sarwono (2012), required several asumptions, as follows:

1. Relationship between variables in the model is linear and addative
2. The residual is assumed to not correlate with the others
3. Variable assumed can be accounted directly
4. The model has a recursive and unidirectional
5. The variables measured in interval scale

Steps of Path Analysis

The steps of path analysis in this research is as follows (Sarwono, 2012):

1. Make path research diagram
2. Formulate the structural equation
3. Formulate statistical hypotheses
4. Calculate path coefficient based on the value of regression coefficient
5. Calculate path coefficient simultaneously
6. Calculate path coefficient partially
7. Make analysis and conclusions

RESULT AND DISCUSSION**The Influence of Implementation of Total Quality Management on Patient Safety Culture**

The result of this research shows that the implementation of TQM in private-owned hospital in Manado positively significantly influence on patient safety culture. This means, the better the implementation of TQM conducted by the hospital, it is better the patient safety culture in that hospital. This result is in line with the result of research conducted by Vouzas and Psychogios (2007) that found that improvement and training, empowerment, employee involvement, and quality are an approach concept of TQM that influence on patient safety. It is also in line that found that TQM significantly influence on patient safety based on the research of Wang et al. (2018) which found that the total effect from total quality management on patient safety culture is significant through the work values, that have a direct influence on the patient safety culture and employee satisfaction.

A positive patient safety culture gives confidence to medical officer that patient safety is an important priority for hospital and the management should support every effort of development in patient safety. Developing patient safety culture requires management support especially the role of leaders in every level, start from the lower-level up to the higher-level.

Besides from management support, working in teamwork is a value that must be built as patient safety culture. Regarding this, Hamdani (2007) stated that working in team has a strong impact on implementation of patient safety culture.

Moreover, Tabrizchi and Sedaghat (2012) stated that the highest dimension is teamwork in unit. Because of this, there is no more reason for hospital not to implementing patient safety cultural not just because it will create material loss but more important it will impact on the death of patient. If there is hospital that ignore the patient safety, it is should be given a penalty for that hospital and health officers.

The Influence of Implementation of Total Quality Management on Service Quality

The result of this research shows that the implementation of TQM in private-owned hospital in Manado positively significantly influence on hospital service quality. This means that the better the implementation of TQM it will also be better the service quality given. This research supported by the research conducted by Tsai, Y. Wu, Shih-Wang (2011), that stated that TQM dominantly influence on service quality.

Hospital is a health facility that play an important role in giving health service to every party needed such as patients, citizens, social organization, health service profession, health department, and local government. Providing health service in hospital always closely relate to health facility, where a comprehensive health service required a comprehensive facility. In making sure the availability of health service to citizen, a nation makes national health system by noticing comprehensive quality management and a good service quality to that the citizens can fulfill the appropriate service.

Ahmad, M. (2011) in his research stated that in order to improve the service quality of general hospital, the management should make an effort to create and synergize the TQM in hospital based on the available equipment and medical tools that supported by a good medical officer. TQM is already considered as a strategic and operational tool to get competitive advantage.

Based on Kozak et al., (2007) TQM can help to overcome any changes like technological advancement and medical system information, service system, health plan, partnership, alliance, and a better patient understanding regarding to service quality. The availability of good TQM will increase the hospital service quality. The importance of service quality reviewed from the operational management point of view can be an important policy in improving competitiveness in providing an equal or more than the expectation level of customer needs.

The Influence of Implementation of Total Quality Management on Patient Satisfaction

The result of this research shows that the implementation of TQM in private-owned hospital in Manado not significantly influence on patient satisfaction. This means that patient satisfaction in private-owned hospital in Manado obtained not by the implementation of TQM conducted. This result is different from the research conducted by Mulyadi et. al. (2013), but in line with the research from Mahmud et. al. (2019).

This result indicated that the implementation of TQM in private-owned hospital in Manado from the point of view of patient, must be improve to be better. In the past, the fuction of hospital is just to treat the sick people, but as it develops, nowadays the hospital has become the health center. Hospital is an organization in which the professional medical officer organized as well as a permanent medical equipment conducting doctoral service, continuous nursing care, diagnostics and disease treatment for patient. Hospital became the pedestal of medical references, especially in treatment problem and individual health recovery. To increase the equalization of equipment and infrastructure of health service to be appropriate with the citizen needs, it is important to understand consumer wants and need, in this case the patient, is the important thing that influence patient satisfaction. A satisfy patient is an important asset because a satisfy patient will continuously use the suitable service, on the other hand, patient who's not satisfy will tell other people about the negative experience twice more than what actually happened.

To create patient satisfaction, hospital must create and manage a system to obtain more patient as well as their own ability to keep the patient. Consumer or patient usually will evaluate thouroughly on every service they receive not only in a matter of service, to say if they are satisfied or not satisfied. Hospital must continuously improve its quality with focusing on patient satisfaction by paying attention on what suggested by patient.

The Influence of Implementation of Total Quality Management on Hospital Performance

The result of this research shows that the implementation of TQM in private-owned hospital in Manado positively significantly influence on hospital performance. This means that the better the implementation of TQM conducted in hospital it will be better the performance of the hospital. This research is in line with the research from Kunst and Lemmink (2009), Irfan, et. al. (2012), Ali, et. al. (2012), Sulijana and Bangun (2015), and Meidiyana, et. al. (2014).

TQM is a management approach on company/organization, that focusing on the quality and based on the participation of the whole human resource inn that company/organization. The main purpose of TQM is a continuous improvement to reach the desired goal which is a good performance. Because of this, the quality of service is very important in competition in fulfilling the health needs and is an important thing that keep the continuation of that hospital. Medical service quality not only be reviewed from the medical technical aspect, but also the health service system in a whole including the management administration, financial, equipment, and medical officer, and so on.

In this case, the implementation of TQM is hoped to create improvisation in managerial performance. By implementing TQM as a system, there is a continuous improvement and consistency in giving service to the patient, it is hoped that it will give a positive influence on managerial performance which is managerial performance improvement for hospital that applying them.

This statement supported by Putro (2010), that the purpose of a company in producing a quality product in the accomplishment of customer satisfaction that marked by the decrease of customer complaint so there is an improvement in performance. It is also in line with Tersziovski and Samson (1999) in Putro (2010) that researching the elements of TQM that made as a quality appreciation system, doing a relationship test between element factor of TQM choosen toward performance factor. It is concluded that element factor of TQM is affecting performance.

The Influence of Implementation of Patient Safety Culture on Patient Satisfaction

The result of this research shows that patient safety culture in private-owned hospital in Manado positively significantly influence on patient satisfaction. This means that the better the patient safety culture conducted in a hospital, the better the satisfaction level of patient. This research is in line with the research from Muninjaya (2011), and Iswati (2017).

A positive patient safety culture creates confidence to the officer that patient safety is a high priority for organization and organization support every effort in development of patient safety in hospitals. Developing patient safety culture in hospital required hospital management support start from the lowest-level officer to the highest-level officer of that hospital. Ignorance on patient safety will create huge loss for patient and the management of hospital. The loss from patient is in form of bigger payment, longer duration of treatment, and the loss from hospital is the cost for treatment that must be covered in order to prevent certain accident in the future.

If the hospital ignores and not implementing patient safety effort, it will affect on the decrease of people trust and will decrease the level of hospital service. That is why in implementing

patient safety, hospital especially the medical officer must pay attention on patient satisfaction based on the medical treatment done, because patient satisfaction is very depended on the performance done by the medical officers.

Patient satisfaction is also well influenced by the behavior and nurse attitude toward the patient, as well as the nurse service quality received by the patient. The action of nurse in this context started by the medication, serving meals, patient injection and so on based on the job description of a nurse. Every action above surely will affect patient satisfaction. If the patient is not satisfied with what's been done by the nurse and other medical officer, then the service quality given by the the hospital is not optimized then will cause the decrease of patient satisfaction that will affect the quality of health service of that hospital. Patient safety effort must be understood and defined well by every part related to this context. This implementation of patient safety, not only related to the officer or human resource related to it, but also the creation of safety environment as well as the things that disturbing the patient convenience.

The Influence of Implementation of Patient Safety Culture on Hospital Performance

This research shows that patient safety culture in private-owned hospital in Manado positively significantly influence on hospital performance. This means that the better the implementation of patient safety culture done by the hospital, then the better the hospital performance.

According to Swift (2017), in hospital in United States of America, it is found that the cause-and-effect of patient safety culture that's not well implemented will affect on the decrease of hospital performance. Furthermore, it is concluded that the patient that faced any unexpected incident make a financial loss around \$500,000 or insurance around \$1 million per incident.

Based on Agency of Healthcare Research and Quality (2011) in assessing patient safety culture in hospital there are several aspect of dimension that must be considered which are expectation and action of supervisor/manager in promoting patient safety, continuous training development, unit teamwork, openness communication, error feedback, non-blame respons, adequate staff, general perception, hospital management support, inter-unit teamwork, patient change and submission, and incident report frequency. That's why the effort of hospital in ensuring the patient safety in closely related from the role of human resource inside the hospital such as doctors, paramedics, management, and also other officers in conducting a good health service activity for patients.

Hospital should aware the importance of patient safety culture because by understanding the patient safety culture, that hospital could identify programs that can conducted as an effort to ensure the safety of patient so that the patient will be free from any unexpected incident. Waslshe and Boaden cited by Setiowati (2010), stated that any error occurred in hospital mostly caused by the mistake of system in hospital that then create the chains inside the system be broken and not only by the individual error.

The Influence of Service Quality on Hospital Patient Satisfaction

The result of this research shows that hospital service quality positively significantly influences on patient satisfaction. This means that the better the service quality given by hospital, the better the patient satisfaction toward the hospital. This result is in line with the research from

Rahum et. al. (2015), Kalaja et. al. (2016), Ravichandran and Kumar (2010). Ramalu and Wei (2011), stated that quality dimensions positively influence on consumer satisfaction.

Parasuraman et. al. (2005) explained that service quality dimension consists of reliability, responsiveness, assurance, empathy, and tangibles. These dimensions are well affected on the expectation and the reality perceived. If the customer received the service that exceeding the expectation, the customer will consider the service as a quality service and then will evolve becoming satisfaction to the service provider and in reverse, if the customer receives the service that can be considered as a service that doesn't met the expectation or below the expected level, then the customer will consider the service provider as not quality service and finally will affect customer satisfaction.

Quality has a very close relationship with customer satisfaction, which is quality providing a push for customer to create a strong relationship with the company. In long-term, this kind of relationship will be enabling the company to understand exactly the customer expectation and their need. This way, the company can improve customer satisfaction that in turn can create customer loyalty toward the company that provide the quality service.

On the other hand, satisfaction is a sense of happiness or disappointment that emerge after comparing the perception or the impression on performance or the result of a product and the expectation. Patient satisfaction is a patient perception that the expectation is fulfilled or exceeded. On the other hand, patient satisfaction directly related to the hospital service quality. By understanding the patient satisfaction level, the hospital management can make certain improvement on service quality. That is why in health service industry, service quality, is very important part in creating customer satisfaction, evenmore for this is closely related to the life and death of patient. In the environment that full with competition, hospital must be aware on the importance of service quality provided so it will be the best service their customer or patient.

The Influence of Service Quality on Hospital Performance

The result of this research shows that service quality in private-owned hospital in Manado positively significantly influence on hospital performance. This means that, the better the service quality provided, then the better is the performance of the hospital. This result is supporting the research from Areva (2015), Sari (2016), Yasa and Suwendra (2013).

Nowadays, company performance is absolute factor that determine the existence and competitiveness of a company. It is more important to have awareness of performance because the increasingly fierce business competition as well as the increase of customer awareness toward their expectation and needs. The criticality of customer on company performance that caused the company to always keep the performance and performance improvement continuously, in order not to lose their customer.

Hospital is a health service institution that conduct individual health service plenary that provide inpatient service, outpatient service, and emergency service (*PMK No. 56, 2014*). A good service and performance is a requirement for hospital either governmental hospital or private hospital in order to improve the quality and work more effectively and more efficient to get the

optimal result for the user of health service so that the hospital will exist and survive di the health service provider competition. Hospital must provide service optimally in order to win the competition. The hospital management can no longer consider the financial factor as the only guidelines in hospital performance management appraisal, so it is needed a real concept and implementable for hospital in order to improve their performance whether financially or non-financially, in this case the service quality.

The development of hospital surely must aware of how far the costumer, which is the patient who wants to use the hospital service for treatment, nursing, and healing. The hospital management should develop the quality and not only focusing on the financial advantage in this case the cheaper fee but lower quality of service provided, will then create consumer benefit loss and sooner or later the customer will leave the hospital caused by the service provided poorly to the patient.

The Influence of Patient Satisfaction on Hospital Performance

The result of this research shows that the patient satisfaction in private-owned hospital in Manado positively significantly influence on hospital performance. This means that, the higher the patient satisfaction, then the better the performance of the hospital. This result support the research from Williams and Naumann (2011), Srivastava et. al. (1998).

Globalization provide a very big impact on the business environment change. Entering the globalization era means that entering the free trade era, which also means that businessman must create and improve the competitive advantage that distinguish them from the competitor. Company must be able to compete with the competitor in order to attract consumer, so the customer satisfaction is becoming the most effective key for company to survive this globalization era.

Customer who has a high satisfaction level will be more loyal, devotedly on a company longer and automatically with spend more money on that company (Williams and Naumann, 2011). Srivastava et. al. (1998) stated that a high customer satisfaction leads to acceleration of cash flow, increasing of volume of cash flow, decrease of risk related to cash flow. The increase on the amount of customer leads to satisfaction then increase the acceleration of cash flow and the decrease of risk related to cash flow.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

From the results of the hypothesis testing, the results are as follows:

1. Implementation of Total Quality Management has a significant positive effect on Patient Safety Culture
2. Implementation of Total Quality Management has a significant positive effect on Service Quality
3. Implementation of Total Quality Management has a significant positive effect on Patient Satisfaction
4. Implementation of Total Quality Management has a significant positive effect on Hospital Performance
5. Patient Safety Culture has a significant positive effect on Patient Satisfaction
6. Patient Safety Culture has a significant positive effect on Hospital Performance

7. Hospital Service Quality has a significant positive effect on Patient Satisfaction
8. Hospital Service Quality has a significant positive effect on Hospital Performance
9. Patient Satisfaction has a significant positive effect on Hospital Performance.

Recommendation

Based on the conclusions of the research results, the implications of this study are:

1. For hospitals to maintain or even improve performance, they must pay more attention to the variables of TQM implementation, patient safety culture, service quality, and patient satisfaction which will have an impact on improving the overall performance of the hospital.
2. In order to improve the quality of hospital services, the manager should try to carry out and synergize the hospital's TQM based on the availability of medical facilities and equipment that are supported by medical personnel who are quite reliable in their fields. The steps taken by the hospital include working with the government, opening opportunities for partnership relations for foreign investors to develop this hospital for the better in the future.
3. To ensure the successful implementation of TQM in the company it is necessary:
 - a. Cultivate a philosophy of quality; Management and employees must fully understand that in order to achieve sustainable organizational survival in a competitive climate, the company must achieve total quality.
 - b. Management must guide and demonstrate quality leadership: From the first stage, the CEO (Chief Executive Officer) must be able to provide good examples in attitude, mindset, and action patterns and show strong leadership in the quality movement.
 - c. Make changes to a more conducive system: By evaluating existing systems and procedures in the organization, whether the system is still conducive and consistent with total quality. The things that need to be evaluated include; organizational structure, activity processes, quality control procedures, human resource development policies, incentive methods and others.
 - d. Educate, train and empower all employees. After the stage of reforming systems and procedures in the organization, the next step is to conduct training on total quality to all members of the organization, including managers. In this empowerment, all employees are given the trust, duty, authority and responsibility to organize themselves into self-managing teams in order to improve processes in achieving product or service quality.
4. This research is still open to be developed and applied to other organizations / companies that have different characteristics by using indicators from the company policies studied.

References

- Ali, K.A.M., M.N Alolayyan, F Idris. 2012, The Impact of Total Quality Management (TQM) on Hospital Performance in the Jordanian Hospitals: an Empirical Evidence, Global Conference on Operations and Supply Chain Management Proceeding, 12-13 March.
- Anggarawati dan Sari. 2016. Kepentingan Bersama Perawat-Dokter Dengan Kualitas Pelayanan Keperawatan. Jurnal Ilmiah Kesehatan Keperawatan, Volume 12, Nomor 1, Februari 2016.

- Areva, Desi. 2015. *"Analisis pengukuran Kinerja Dengan Sistem Balanced Scorecard Pada Rumah Sakit Yos Sudarso Padang"*. JURNAL ECONOMICA: Research of Economic And Economic Education. Vol 1 No.1:120-132.
- Fandy, Tjiptono. 2011. *Service Management Mewujudkan Layanan Prima*. 2nd Edition. Yogyakarta: Andi.
- Gaspersz, Vincent. 2005. *"Sistem Manajemen Kinerja Terintegrasi Balanced Scorecard Dengan Six Sigma Untuk Organisasi Bisnis dan Pemerintah"*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Gavrea et al (2011) Determinants of Organizational Performance : The Case of Romania. Management & Marketing Challenges for the Knowledge Society
- Irfan, S.M., Ijaz, A., Kee, D.M.H and Awan, M. 2012. Improving Operational Performance of Public Hospital in Pakistan: a TQM Based Approach, World Applied Sciences Journal, 19 (6).
- Kalaja, Rezarta.,Redi Myshketa., Francesco Scalera. 2016. Service quality assessment in health care sector: the case of Durres public hospital. 12th International Journal of Strategic Management Conference, Antalya, Turkey. 23(5): 557-565.
- Kunst, P., and Lemmink, J. 2009. Quality Management and Performance in Hospitals : A Search for Success Parameter. Total Quality Management. Desember, Vol. 11, Issue 8, pp. 1123-1133
- Meidiyana, A.V., Rutniyaningsih, S., Immanuela, I. 2014. *"Pengaruh Total Quality Management (TQM) terhadap Kinerja Manajerial dengan Sistem Pengukuran Kinerja dan Sistem Penghargaan (Reward) sebagai Variabel Moderating pada PT Inka (Persero) Madiun"*. Jurnal Riset Manajemen dan Akuntansi, Vol. 02, No. 01 : 1-8.
- Mulyadi, Dedi., Uus M. Fadli, Fitriyani Cipta Kusuma Ningsih. 2013. *"Analisis Manajemen Mutu Pelayanan Kesehatan pada Rumah Sakit Islam Karawang"*. Jurnal Manajemen, 10 (3), 1203- 1219.
- Muninjaya, A.A.G. 2011. *Manajemen Mutu Pelayanan Kesehatan*. Jakarta: EGC Nursya'bani Purnama (2006). *Manajemen Kualitas, Perspektif Global, Edisi Pertama, Ekonisia Fakultas Ekonomi*.
- Putro, Suratno Nugroho. 2010. *"Pengaruh Pertumbuhan Ekonomi, Pendapatan Asli Daerah dan Dana alokasi Umum Terhadap Pengalokasian Anggaran Belanja Modal (Study Kasus pada Kabupaten/Kota di Provinsi Jawa Tengah)"*. Universitas Esa Unggul: Jakarta
- Ravichandran, K. Bhargavi, S. Arun Kumar. 2010. "Influence of Service Quality On Banking Customer Behavioural Intentions", International Journal of Economics and finance, 2(4): 18-29
- Samson D. & Terziovski M. (1999), The Relationship between total quality management practices and operational performance. Journal of Operations Management 17.
- Setiowati, Dwi. 2010. *Hubungan Kepemimpinan Efektif Head Nurse dengan Penerapan Budaya Keselamatan Pasien oleh Perawat Pelaksana di RSUPN Dr. Cipto Mangunkusumo Jakarta* [Tesis]. Depok: Universitas Indonesia
- Srivastava, R. K., Shervani, T. A., & Fahey, L. (1998). Market-based assets and shareholder value: a framework for analysis. The Journal of Marketing, 2-18.
- Sulijaya dan Bangun. 2015. *"Pengaruh Total Quality Management, Motivasi dan Komitmen Organisasi Terhadap Kinerja Manajerial Pada PT. Sekar Bumi"*. Tbk Jurnal Akuntansi Vol. 19 No. 03 September 2015.
- Tabrizchi, N, Sedaghat, M. The First Study of Patient Safety Culture in Iranian Primary Health Centers. Jurnal Acta Medica Iranica; 2012: 50(7): 505-510
- Tjiptono, Fandy dan Anastasia Diana. (2003). Total Quality Management. Edisi Revisi. Yogyakarta: Andi Offset.
- Gaspersz, Tsai, Y., Wu, Shih-Wang. 2011. Enhancing Total Quality Management and Service Quality through Patient Safety Management
- Vincent. (2011). Total Quality Management (untuk Praktisi Bisnis dan Industri). Jakarta: Penebar Swadaya
- Vouzas, F., & Psychogios, A. G. (2007). Assessing managers' awareness of TQM. TQM Magazine, 19(1), 62-75. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09544780710720844>
- Adz-Dzakiey Hamdani Bakran, 2007. Psikologi Kenabian, Yogyakarta: Al-Manar
- Wei, C.C., dan Ramalu, S.S. (2011), "Student Satisfaction Toward The University : Does Service Quality Matters ?", International Journal of Education, Vol.3, No.2, E.15

Williams, P., & Naumann, E. (2011). Customer Satisfaction and Business Performance: A FirmLevel Analysis. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 25(1), 20-32

Williams, P., & Naumann, E. (2011). Customer Satisfaction and Business Performance: A FirmLevel Analysis. *Journal of Serv*

Yasa, G, M, dan Suwendra, I, W, 2013. Pengukuran Kinerja Dengan Konsep Balanced Scorecard Pada Rumah Sakit Umum Parama Sidhi Singaraja, Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha: Bali.